



**THE STATES assembled on Thursday
16th December 2021, at 9.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst – excused attendance (joined at 10.03 a.m.)
Connétable Sadie Anthea Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour – excused attendance (joined at 12.09 pm.)
Connétable Richard Vibert of St. Peter – excused attendance
Deputy Jessica Harriet Perchard of St. Saviour – ill
Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier – excused attendance (joined at 9.56 a.m.)

Prayers

Standing Order 55A – remote participation

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams.

Documents presented

Estate Management (follow-up) (P.A.C.3/2021): Executive Response P.A.C.3/2021.
(P.A.C.3/2021 Res.) – comments. Res.Com.
Presented: 16th December 2021, *Public Accounts Committee*.

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, agreed that the Assembly would continue consideration of public business until 8.00 p.m. that day with a thirty-minute adjournment at 5.30 p.m.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 34

Senator I.J. Gorst
Senator L.J. Farnham
Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
Senator T.A. Vallois
Senator K.L. Moore
Senator S.W. Pallett
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of St. Brelade

CONTRE: 9

Senator S.C. Ferguson
Senator S.Y. Mézec
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of St. John

ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025 P.90/2021

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended, and, resuming consideration of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Brelade (P.90/2021 Amd.(2)), as amended, and, resumed consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.90/2021 Amd.(2)Amd.(2)) and, adopting the amendment, agreed that, in Part 1, for the words “deliverable by 30th April 2022” should be substituted the words “deliverable by 29th July 2022”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 41

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator T.A. Vallois
 Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin

CONTRE: 3

Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Connétable of St. Brelade, as amended, agreed that, in Paragraph (f), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that in Summary Table 5(i), £500,000 should be transferred from the General Reserve Head of Expenditure to fund the undertaking of an independent review of the Island’s response to the Covid-19 pandemic, deliverable by 29th July 2022, the Council of Ministers being requested, in conjunction with the Privileges and Procedures Committee, to take such steps as are necessary to initiate a review that will deliver an objective and independent analysis of the actions undertaken in response to the Covid-19 pandemic and provide recommendations and guidelines for the management of any future pandemic or similarly disruptive event”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 37

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John

CONTRE: 5

Senator T.A. Vallois
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)

ABSTAIN: 1

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)

Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.90/2021 Amd.(6), agreed that, in Paragraph (f), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, with funding to be allocated from the Covid-19 response head of expenditure in Summary Table 5(i), and made available for use by the Minister for Infrastructure, to provide for the establishment from 1st January 2022, or as soon as possible thereafter in 1st quarter of 2022, of a bus pass scheme (for which a charge of £20 per annum should be levied on the individual) for all people eligible to pay fares aged 18 years or under; with the overall cost of, take-up of, and customer satisfaction with the scheme, to be subsequently reviewed by the Minister and the outcome of the review to be published by the end of the third quarter of 2022”

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 23

Senator T.A. Vallois
 Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy R. Labey (H)

CONTRE: 20

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)	Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)	Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
Deputy J.H. Young (B)	Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
Deputy of St. John	Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)	Deputy of Trinity
Deputy R.J. Ward (H)	Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
Deputy C.S. Alves (H)	
Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)	
Deputy I. Gardiner (H)	

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.90/2021 Amd.(11)) that, in Paragraph (f), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5 (i) and (ii) to the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, with provision to be made from the Covid-19 Reserve within the General Reserve, to the Children, Young People, Education and Skills Department to ensure that all schools have a guaranteed minimum 15% headroom funding remaining after staffing and accommodation costs have been taken into account.”

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 21

Senator T.A. Vallois
 Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

CONTRE: 22

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, commencing consideration of an amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.90/2021 Amd.(16)), acceded to a request by Senator Tracey Anne Vallois, acting as rapporteur, in accordance with Standing Order 69(4) that the amendment be withdrawn.

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), Senator Tracey Anne Vallois, acting as rapporteur, had informed the Greffier of the States that two amendments of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.90/2021 Amd.(17) and P.90/2021 Amd.(20)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021) had been withdrawn.

Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025 P.90/2021

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended, and rejected an amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.90/2021 Amd.(18)) that, in Paragraph (f), after the words “set out in Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i) – 2022 Revenue Heads of Expenditure, the Head of Expenditure for Children, Young People, Education and Skills shall be increased by £10 million to allow for additional resources to implement the recommendations of the Inclusion Review and to cover any shortfall in funding identified within the new school funding formula for 2022.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 21

Senator T.A. Vallois
 Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

CONTRE: 21

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

ABSTAIN: 1

Deputy of St. John

THE STATES noted that, as there was an equality of votes, the matter had been determined in the negative in accordance with Article 16(2) of the States of Jersey Law 2005.

Changes in Presidency

The Bailiff retired from the Chair during consideration of the amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.90/2021 Amd.(18)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers

entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended, and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Dr. Mark Egan, Greffier of the States. The Bailiff returned to the Chamber during consideration of the same proposition and the meeting continued under his Presidency.

Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025 P.90/2021

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended, and commenced consideration of an amendment of Senator Samuel Yves Mézec (P.90/2021 Amd.(12)).

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(a), Senator Kristina Louise Moore and Deputy Gregory Charles Umberto Guida of St. Lawrence declared an interest, as they or their spouse earned more than the Upper Earnings Limit, and withdrew from the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the amendment of Senator Samuel Yves Mézec (P.90/2021 Amd.(12)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers.

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier that they adjourn, with consideration of public business to continue on Friday 17th December 2021.

Suspension of meeting

The Bailiff, during consideration of the proposition of Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier that the States adjourn, suspended the meeting, in accordance with Standing Order 46, in order to that he might consider the application and interpretation of Standing Order 106, and the declaration of interests by elected members, during the debate on the amendment of Senator Samuel Yves Mézec (P.90/2021 Amd.(12)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended.

Declarations of interest under Standing Order 106 – ruling by the Bailiff

The Bailiff informed the States of the following ruling that he had made in respect of declarations of interest under Standing Order 106 during consideration of the amendment of Senator Samuel Yves Mézec (P.90/2021 Amd.(12)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended –

“I have made the best inquiries that I am able to understand what the ambit of the proposition is. I remind Members of what I said earlier about the declaration of interest. It is any Member of the States who has, or whose spouse or civil partner or cohabitee has, an interest in the subject matter of the proposition must, if it is a direct financial interest, declare the interest and withdraw from the Chamber for the duration of the debate and any vote on the proposition. On the best information that I have available to me, it is anyone with an income of above £250,000 who falls within the catchment of this particular proposition and who therefore would have a direct financial interest. That is the ruling, if called upon to give it now, I would feel constrained to give in accordance with Standing Orders.”

Adjournment

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier, adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Friday 16th December 2021 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2022-2025’ (P.90/2021), as amended, and the remaining outstanding amendments.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 25

Senator I.J. Gorst

Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

CONTRE: 19

Senator L.J. Farnham

Senator T.A. Vallois
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. John
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES rose at 7.30 p.m.

L.-M. HART

Deputy Greffier of the States